# COMPARING GOOGLE TRANSLATE AND INSTAGRAM ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS OF CAPTIONS

# Dwi Nur Asiyah Ningrum<sup>1</sup>, Issy Yuliasri<sup>2</sup>

English Education Department, Faculty Language and Arts Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang, Indonesia Email: dwinurasiyah560@gmail.com

Abstract

: Nowadays, machine translators like Google Translate are widely used by people. However, it does not mean that machine translators can always be relied on and produce good translations. This study aimed to analyze the translation quality of Instagram Machine Translation and Google Translate in terms of accuracy, acceptability, and readability. The objective of this research was to find out which machine translator is better between Instagram Machine Translation and Google Translate in translating Instagram captions. The data from the questionnaire were described in qualitative form. Nababan's translation quality instrument (2012) was adopted to assess the quality of the translation results from Google Translate and Instagram Machine Translation, where the translations were assessed with points one, two, or three according to the quality of the translation. The results of the analysis show that in three aspects, namely accuracy, acceptability, and readability, Google Translate is superior to Instagram Machine Translation.

Keywords : Translation Quality, Instagram Translation, Google Translate

#### INTRODUCTION

Translation is quite a problem for many people because it involves a person's language skills. Although there is English, which is used as the international language, there are still many people, including Indonesians, who do not master it. Based on the data on EF EPI (English Proficiency Index) web, Indonesia is categorized as low-proficiency in English and ranked 15th out of 24 Asian countries, while out of 100 countries in the world Indonesia is in position 74<sup>th</sup>. The existence of a machine translator such as Google Translate, Microsoft Translator, iTranslate, Bing Translation provides a solution to that problem. A machine translator will provide the core meaning of a text. Therefore, even if it is considered inaccurate, the reader will still understand the whole information of the translated text (Meilasari, 2019). Instagram, a well-known social media and widely used by the young generation, also has an automatic translator feature that can be used to translate captions, bios, and also

comments.

Despite its existence which solves the translation problem, machine translators have drawbacks and give disadvantages to their users if they are not used properly and without human intervention. As revealed by Peng (2018) in his journal, machine translators have poor sentence construction and word selection. Words and sentences that have special meanings are also difficult to translate, and often the result of machine translation looks more like the source text than the intended meaning. Thrivini (2002) argues that social understanding and knowledge of the characteristics of a translation (the characteristics oftranslated text) must be considered so that the translation can be completed properly. This gives an understanding that in writing a translation, a text containing cultural elements cannot be translated by a machine translator. Tripathi and Sarkhel (2010) say that the existence of a machine translator is used to assist and simplify the translation process, but not to translate the entire

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

contents of the document without editing because machine translators cannot provide perfect translation results. The existing machine translation applications may be able to translate literal translations but are not able to create an equivalent translation between the source language and the target language.

A study to compare human translators with machine translators conducted by Ahrenberg (2017) found that there are several steps taken by human translators to achieve a translated text that has a high equivalence between the source text and the target text. These methods cannot be done by machine translators. Some of the most important discoveries are sentence splitting, sunction and category changes. explicitation, and paraphrase. This is in line with what was conveyed by Machen, Prou, and Tezcan (2020) which says that although machine translators have developed, they still have not produced consistent translations SO that the translation results cannot be published high-quality immediately. To get translations, human intervention is still needed, which is called post-editing.

Many studies discuss the quality of a machine translator, one of them is research conducted by Halimah (2018). The purpose of her study is to determine whether Google translate can produce translations and to what extent translations made by Google Translation are acceptable. Content Analysis approach was applied in this study to analyze English procedural text on a "VIXAL Lebih Wangi". She found that there were several differences between the translation produced by humans and the translation produced by Google translate. The similarity between the two translations is only 29% because the choice of words used is not the same, resulting in a translation that has a different meaning. Human translation is more acceptable than the translation produced by Google translate so that in its use it requires the role of humans to be able to produce good translations.

Another is research conducted by Nainggolan, Sinurat and Hutauruk (2020) focus on knowing the level of accuracy of the translation results generated by Google Translate. The subject of that research is Rysava's (2012) article with the title "Noun Phrase in English". From 25 data of noun phrases, the researcher found 11 datum of noun phrases as accurate translations, 13 datum of noun phrases as less accurate translations, and 1 datum of noun phrases as an inaccurate translation. In conclusion, the results of the Google translate translation in translating a noun phrase are categorized as less accurate.

Different from previous studies, this machine research compared two translations, namely Google Translate and Instagram Machine Translation. The reason why the researcher chose Instagram Machine Translation is that Instagram is a very popular social media and is widely used by Indonesian people. While Google Translate is a machine translator that is known by many people so it will be when the interesting two translators are compared for their quality. This research is expected to provide benefits for Google Translate and Instagram users so that they know the quality of the two machine translators.

#### RESEARCH METHOD

Descriptive qualitative research was used in this study. There were two types of objects, including material objects and final objects. For the material object in this study, the researchers used Instagram captions from accounts belonging to Leena Snoubar (@withloveleena), and the final object was a questionnaire assessed by respondents using Nababan's theory of translation quality (2012).

In collecting the data, there were several stages carried out by researchers. The stages included choosing some Instagram captions from the @withloveleena account, translating the selected captions using

Instagram Machine Translator and Google Translate then writing down the translation results, distributing the questionnaire, and lastly, analyzing the results of the questionnaire.

To analyze the data, the researchers used an instrument proposed by Nababan. There were three aspects assessed in this instrument, namely accuracy, acceptability and readability. The aspect of accuracy emphasizes the equivalence of the content or message in the text. Acceptability aspect refers to whether the translation result has been adjusted to the norms or customs that apply in the target language or not. For the readability aspect, according to what Nababan said, it does not only refer to the source language but also the target language.

For the the accuracy aspect, questionnaire was assessed by three lecturers who have at least a master degree. They were asked to give a score. Translations that were given score 3 were judged to be accurate, translation that were given score 2 were judged to be less accurate, and translation that were given score 1 were judged to be inaccurate. In acceptability and readability aspects, the questionnaire was assessed by twenty assessors who are native Indonesians. They were asked to give a score with the range 1 to 3. Score 3 means that the translations were acceptable for the acceptability aspect and had a high level of readability for the readability aspect, score 2 means that the translation were less acceptable for the acceptability aspect and had a medium level of readability for the readability aspect, and score 1 means that the translation were unacceptable of acceptability aspect and had a low level readability for readability aspect

### FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

After analyzing the data, it shows that Google Translate has better translation quality than Instagram Machine Translation. This is because Google Translate has a higher percentage of data

that has 3 points in all aspects (accuracy, acceptability, readability).

# **Accuracy of the Translation**

The translation is considered accurate if the meaning of the translation is translated accurately and perfectly from source language to target language without any mistake. A score of two for translations rated "Less Accurate". The translation is rated as "Less Accurate" if the translation is almost translated perfectly, but there is distortion in meaning and it annoys the message of the source language. The last one is a score of one. A score of one is for translations that are judged "Inaccurate" which means that the translations are not accurately translated into the target language. There were 40 Instagram captions used for this aspect of accuracy taken from the Instagram account @withloveleena.

The questionnaire filled in by the respondents shows that the translation from Google translate has a higher percentage of accurate data than the Instagram machine translation. Google Translate percentage of 32.5% for data that is considered accurate or gets 3 points while Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 15%. Then for data that is considered less accurate or gets 2 points, google translate has a percentage of 58.33% while Instagram machine translation has a percentage of 61.61%. For data that is considered inaccurate or gets 1 point, google translate has a percentage of 9.17% while instagram machine translation has a percentage of 23.33%.

Table 1. The amount of data and percentage on the aspect of accuracy

	0			•
			Quality	
			Accuracy	
No ·	Machine Translation	3 (Accurate)	2 (Less Accurate)	1 (Inaccurate)

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

1.	IMT	18 (15%)	74 (61.67%)	28 (23.33%)	
Т	Total Data		120 Data		
2.	GT	39 (32.5%)	70 (58.33%)	11 (9.17%)	

#### Accurate

As explained above, the criteria for an item to be considered accurate are the word meanings, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences. or source language transferred into the target accurately language; absolutely no meaning distortions.

#### **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translator has a percentage of 15% for translations that are considered accurate or get 3 points. Below is an example of an accurate translation of **Instagram Machine Translation:** 

# (**Datum A-18**)

# **Original Caption:**

Some of my favorite past springtime looks! □□ which would you wear?

#### **Translation Caption**

Beberapa penampilan musim semi terakhir favorit saya! □ □ mana yang akan kamu kenakan?

On the result of the translation above, all raters gave 3 points. It means that the translation is accurate. Information from the source language translates well to the target language. Every word and sentence is translated precisely so that there is no distortion of meaning.

# **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage for accurate data or translation that gets 3 points as much as 32.5%. Below is an example of an accurate translation of **Instagram Machine Translation:** 

#### (**Datum B-38**)

# **Original Caption:**

Dear baby, you have a cute wardrobe waiting for you if that makes you want to come any faster? 

I have been taking this week to rest, focus on taking care of myself and enjoying the end of my pregnancy. As uncomfortable as I am now, I started thinking about how much I will miss her being in my tummy yesterday and it made me so emotional

# **Translation Caption**:

Sayang sayang, Anda memiliki lemari pakaian lucu yang menunggu Anda jika itu membuat Anda ingin datang lebih *cepat?* □ *Saya telah mengambil minggu* ini untuk beristirahat, fokus merawat diri sendiri dan menikmati akhir kehamilan saya. Tidak nyaman seperti saya sekarang, saya mulai berpikir tentang betapa akan saya merindukannya berada di perut saya kemarin dan itu membuat saya sangat  $emosional \square$ 

On the result of the translation above, all raters gave 3 points. It means that the translation is accurate. Information from the source language translates well to the target language. Every word and sentence is translated precisely so that there is no distortion of meaning.

#### **Less Accurate**

Less Accurate data is data that most of the meaning of words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or source language has been text transferred accurately into the target language. However, there are still meaning distortions or double-meaning translation (ambiguous) or eliminated meaning, which interferes with the integrity of the message.

#### **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 61.67% for translations that are less accurate or for translations that get 2 points. Below is an example of a less accurate translation from Instagram Machine Translation:

# (**Datum A-6**)

# Original Caption: □□♀□□□ Alaina and I are out of office for the rest of the summer (I wish □) Translation Caption:

# □□♀□□□ Alaina dan aku keluar dari kantor untuk sisa musim panas (aku berharap □)

On this data, all raters give 2 points for the translation results. This means that the message from the source language is translated well, but there are still meaning distortions, ambiguous meanings or missing meanings that reduce the authenticity of the meaning.

# **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 58.33% on data that is considered less accurate or gets 2 points. Below is an example of a less accurate translation from Google Translate:

#### (Datum B-3)

# **Original Caption:**

Happy first Father's Day to my husband □ I have loved watching you step so naturally into the role of a father this past year and couldn't have asked for a better man to lead our family!!! Alaina is so blessed to have you as her Baba to look up to! You hold us together and are strong for us even when things feel like they are falling apart □ I love you so much!!!

# **Translation Caption :**

Selamat Hari Ayah pertama untuk suami saya □ Saya senang melihat Anda melangkah secara alami ke dalam peran seorang ayah tahun lalu dan tidak bisa meminta pria yang lebih baik untuk memimpin keluarga kami!!! Alaina sangat diberkati memiliki Anda sebagai Baba yang harus dijunjung! Kamu menyatukan kita dan kuat untuk kita bahkan ketika hal-hal terasa seperti berantakan □ Aku sangat mencintaimu!!!

#### **Inaccurate**

Data is considered Inaccurate if the word meanings, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or source-language text are not accurately transferred into the target language, deliberately.

## **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 23.33% for data that is considered inaccurate or gets 1 point. Below is an example of an inaccurate translation from Instagram Machine Translation:

## (Datum A-19)

# Original Caption

Ventured 5 steps outside the front door to document this winter wonderland!!! We haven't had power all day, but we are cozied by the fire and enjoying having nowhere to be ♣□□

# Translation Caption

Berkelana 5 langkah di luar pintu depan untuk mendokumentasikan dunia dongeng musim dingin ini!!! Kami belum memiliki kekuatan sepanjang hari, tetapi kami dikejar oleh api dan menikmati tidak ada tempat untuk berada

All of the three raters gave one point for the translation of the data. That means the message from the source language is not translated accurately to the target language. However, in this study, the researcher did not conduct interviews with the raters so the researcher could not find out the reason why two raters gave one score while one gave two points.

### **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 9.17% for data that is inaccurate or gets 1 point. Below is an example of an inaccurate translation from Google Translate:

#### (Datum B-38)

### **Original Caption:**

Dear baby, you have a cute wardrobe waiting for you if that makes you want

to come any faster? □ I have been taking this week to rest, focus on taking care of myself and enjoying the end of my pregnancy. As uncomfortable as I am now, I started thinking about how much I will miss her being in my tummy yesterday and it made me so emotional □

### **Translation Caption** :

Sayang sayang, Anda memiliki lemari pakaian lucu yang menunggu Anda jika itu membuat Anda ingin datang lebih cepat? □ Saya telah mengambil minggu ini untuk beristirahat, fokus merawat diri sendiri dan menikmati akhir kehamilan saya. Tidak nyaman seperti saya sekarang, saya mulai berpikir tentang betapa saya akan merindukannya berada di perut saya kemarin dan itu membuat saya sangat emosional □

Two of the three raters gave one point for the translation of the data. That means the message from the source language is not translated accurately to the target language. However, in this study, the researcher did not conduct interviews with the raters so the researcher could not find out the reason why two raters gave one score while one gave two points.

#### **Acceptability of the Translation**

A translation is considered acceptable if the translations are natural; the technical terms are commonly used and familiar to the reader; phrases, clauses, and sentences are in accordance with the rules of the Indonesian language. Then a score of two is for the translation that already feels natural; however, there are a few problems in the use of technical terms or grammatical errors. A score of one is for unnatural translations; the technical terms are not commonly used and not familiar to the readers; phrases, clauses, and sentences are not in accordance with the rules of the Indonesian language.

The results of the questionnaire show that Google Translate has a higher percentage of accurate translations than Instagram Machine Translation. On Google Translate the translation that gets 3 points is 48% and on Instagram, Machine Translation has as much as 22.62%. Then, for translations that get 2 points, Instagram Machine Translation is superior to Instagram Machine Translation. The data on Instagram Machine Translation that gets 2 points is 51.5% while Google Translate is 44.5%. Furthermore, for translations that get one point or are not acceptable, Instagram Machine Translation gets higher points, namely as much as 25.88% while Google Translate is only 7.5%.

#### Acceptable

Translation is considered acceptable if it feels natural, the terms used are easy to understand by the reader and the grammar used is in accordance with the rules in the target language.

### **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 22.62% for translations that are considered acceptable. Below is an

		Quality			
		Acceptability			
No.	Machine Translation	3 (Acceptab le)	(Less Acceptabl	(Not Acceptabl	
1.	IMT	181 (22.62%)	412 (51.5%)	207 (25.88%)	
Total Data		;	800 Data		
2.	GT	384 (48%)	356 (44.5%)	60 7.5%	
	1 0				

example of an acceptable translation from Instagram Machine Translation:

# **(Datum A-4)**

### **Original Caption:**

Feeling so so grateful  $\Box \Box \Box$  I cannot believe we only have a few more weeks until we are a little family! God willing

# Translation Caption

Merasa sangat bersyukur  $\Box \Box \Box$  Aku tidak percaya kita hanya memiliki

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

354

Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

beberapa minggu lagi sampai kita menjadi keluarga kecil! InsyaAllah □

In the translation above, twelve raters gave three points, six raters gave two points and two raters gave one point. The translation was categorized as acceptable because there are half of the raters gave three points. This indicates that the translation is considered natural, the terms used are familiar and the grammar used is by the rules of the target language.

# **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 48% for data that is considered acceptable. Below is an example of an acceptable translation from Google Translate:

#### **(Datum B-4)**

# **Original Caption**

Feeling so so grateful  $\Box \Box \Box \Box$  I cannot believe we only have a few more weeks until we are a little family! God willing

# **Translation Caption**

Merasa sangat bersyukur  $\square \square \square \square$  Saya tidak percaya kita hanya memiliki beberapa minggu lagi sampai kita menjadi keluarga kecil! Insya Allah 🗆

In the translation above, twelve raters gave three points, six raters gave two points and two raters gave one point. The translation was categorized as acceptable because there are half of the raters gave three points. This indicates that the translation is considered natural, the terms used are familiar and the grammar used is by the rules of the target language.

#### Less Acceptable

Less Acceptable translations translations that already feel natural but there are some phrases, clauses, sentences that are still not familiar to the reader and are also translated not by the grammar of the target language.

#### **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 51.5% for data that is considered less acceptable. Below is an

P.ISSN: 2548-7728 E.ISSN: 2599-0373

example of a less acceptable translation from Instagram Machine Translation:

# (**Datum A-7**)

# **Original Caption:**

A rare photo of all of us together! Everyone is making me look short because they are wearing heels! Except Naeem haha □ We always get asked if we are full siblings and we are! Do you think we look alike or no?

# **Translation Caption**

Foto langka kita semua bersama! Semua orang membuatku terlihat pendek karena mereka mengenakan sepatu hak tinggi! Kecuali Naeem hahaha □ Kami selalu ditanya apakah kami saudara kandung lengkap dan kami! Menurutmu kita mirip atau tidak?

In this data, three raters gave three points, fourteen raters gave two points and three raters gave one point. The number of raters who gave two points (14 raters) shows that the translation is quite natural but there are still clauses, phrases and sentences that are less familiar to readers.

#### **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 51.5% for data that is considered less acceptable. Below is an example of a less acceptable translation from Google Translate:

#### (Datum B-3)

### **Original Caption:**

37 weeks! □ My app says the baby is
around 6.5 lb and the size of a small
melon! Baby is practicing her karate
moves while I practically stand on my
head trying to get her to turn into the
head down position □□ My hospital
bag is packed and I've got all the gear
and no idea □□ but we are so excited!!
Please keep us in your prayers $\Box \Box \Box$

### **Translation Caption**

minggu! Aplikasi mengatakan bayinya sekitar 6,5 lb dan seukuran melon kecil! Baby sedang berlatih gerakan karatenya sementara

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

saya praktis berdiri di atas kepala saya mencoba membuatnya berubah menjadi posisi kepala di bawah  $\Box \Box$  Tas rumah sakit saya penuh sesak dan saya punya semua perlengkapan dan tidak tahu tapi kami sangat bersemangat!! Tolong jaga kami dalam doa-doamu □□□

In this data, four raters gave three points, sixteen raters gave two points and none of the raters gave one point. The number of raters who gave two points (16 raters) shows that the translation is quite natural but there are still clauses, phrases and sentences that are less familiar to readers.

# Unacceptable

Score one is for translation that the technical terms are not commonly used and not familiar to the readers; phrases, clauses, and sentences are not in accordance with the rules of the target language.

# **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 25.88% for data that is considered unacceptable. Below is an example of an unacceptable translation from Instagram Machine Translation:

# (Datum A-1)

# **Original Caption:**

Dressing room/Office progress! I asked you guys what I should put on the other side of my vanity to balance out the mirror and several of you are saying a plant, but I'm not sure if I have enough space for a plant there!! I was thinking some floating shelves for more shoe storage? I don't want it to look too cluttered 

Let me know what you think?! linked

decor here!

http://liketk.it/2SqVI #liketkit @liketok now.it

### **Translation Caption**

Kemajuan ruang ganti/kantor! Saya bertanya kepada kalian apa yang harus saya letakkan di sisi lain kesombongan saya untuk menyeimbangkan cermin

dan beberapa dari kalian mengatakan tanaman, tetapi saya tidak yakin apakah saya memiliki cukup ruang untuk tanaman di sana!! Sava berpikir terapung beberapa rak untuk penyimpanan sepatu lebih banyak? Saya tidak ingin ini terlihat terlalu kacau □ Beri tahu saya apa yang Anda pikirkan?! Dekorasi yang ditautkan di http://liketk.it/2SqVI sini! #liketkit @liketoknow.it

In the translation, there were thirteen raters who gave one point. This shows that the translation is in the unacceptable category. Which means that the meaning of the translation cannot be understood by the reader at all.

#### **Google Translate**

In this category none of the data gets one point from more than ten appraisers. This indicates that Google Translate produces acceptable translations.

# **Readability of the Translation**

There are three levels for this category, namely high level readability, medium level readability and low level readability. The translation results that fall into the category of high level readability are translations in which the words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or text translations can be easily understood by readers. Then the medium-level readability is for translations that make the reader have to read the translation more than once to be able to understand its meaning. The last one, Lowlevel readability, is for translation whose meaning cannot be understood at all by the reader. In this category, Google Translate is superior to Instagram Machine Translation because it has a percentage of the amount of data that has 3 points as much as 46.25%, while Instagram Machine Translation only has a percentage of 29.5%. Furthermore, for translations that get 2 points, Instagram Machine Translation has a higher percentage of 54.5% while Google Translate has a percentage of 45.75%. Then for translations that get 1 point or fall into

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching) Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

the unreadable category, Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 16% while Google Translate has a percentage of 8%.

Table 3. The amount of data and percentage on the aspect of acceptability

		Quality				
	a u	Readability				
No ·	Machine Translation	3 (High Level Readability )	(Medium Level Readability	Low Level Readability		
1.	IMT	236 (29.5%)	436 (54.5%)	128 (16%)		
Total Data		800 Data				
2.	GT	370 (46.25%)	366 (45.75%)	64 (8%)		

# **High Level Readability**

A translation is considered to have a high level of readability if the words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or text translations can be easily understood by the reader.

# **Instagram Machine Translations**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 29.5% for data that is considered to have a high level of readability. Below is an example of data that falls into that category:

#### (Datum A-27)

# **Original Caption:**

Happy Friday and happy March Lovelies!! Let's have a coffee date to celebrate □ □ My sisters are coming to town this weekend and I'm so excited! They haven't even met Leo yet! □

# **Translation Caption**

Selamat hari Jumat dan selamat Maret Lovelies!! Mari kita minum kopi untuk merayakanya 

Saudariku akan datang ke kota akhir pekan ini dan aku sangat bersemangat! Mereka bahkan belum bertemu Leo! □

In the translation above, there are eleven raters who agree that the translation has a high level of readability. A high level of readability means that words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or text translations can be easily understood by the reader.

#### **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 46.25% for data that is considered to have a high level of readability. Below is an example of data that falls into that category:

# **(Datum B-3)**

# **Original Caption:**

We've been very busy □□□ having the best time on our family vacation!! We are staying at the most beautiful @vrbo home and is seriously perfect for our big family! We have our own private pool with this stunning view!! □#ad

#### **Translation Caption**

Kami sangat sibuk □□□ bersenang-senang di liburan keluarga kami!! Kami menginap di rumah @vrbo yang paling indah dan sangat cocok untuk keluarga besar kami! Kami memiliki kolam renang pribadi dengan pemandangan yang menakjubkan ini!! □#iklan

In the translation above, there are fifteen raters who agree that the translation has a high level of readability. A high level of readability means that words, technical terms, phrases, clauses, sentences, or text translations can be easily understood by the reader.

# **Medium Level Readability**

A translation is considered to have a medium level of readability if the reader has to read it more than once to understand its meaning.

#### **Instagram Machine Translation**

Instagram Machine Translation has a percentage of 54.5% for translations that have a medium readability level. Below is

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

an example of data that falls into that category:

#### (**Datum A-11**)

# **Original Caption:**

Bringing out all the cute Middle Eastern style photos for Ramadan □ I hope you girls are making the most out of these last few beautiful nights!! □□□

# **Translation Caption**

Membawa semua foto gaya Timur Tengah yang lucu untuk Ramadhan □ Saya harap kalian membuat yang terbaik dari beberapa malam yang indah ini!! □□□

In the translation above, there are fourteen raters who agree that the translation has a medium level of readability. A medium level of readability means that the reader has to read it more than once to understand its meaning.

# **Google Translate**

Google Translate has a percentage of 45.75% in translations that have a low readability level. Below is an example of data that falls into that category:

#### (Datum **B-24**)

# **Original Caption:**

Who else was actually relieved when instagram went down yesterday?! At first I thought I got hacked □ after I realized I wasn't, It felt like a mini vacation! Makes me realize I need to unplug way more often. What about you?

# **Translation Caption**

Siapa lagi yang sebenarnya lega ketika instagram down kemarin?! Awalnya saya pikir saya diretas □ setelah saya sadar ternyata tidak, Rasanya seperti liburan mini! Membuat saya sadar bahwa saya perlu mencabut lebih sering. Bagaimana denganmu?

In the translation above, there are thirteen raters who agree that the translation has a medium level of readability. A medium level of readability means that the

reader has to read it more than once to understand its meaning.

# **Low Level Readability**

A translation that is categorized as having a low level of readability is a translation whose meaning cannot be understood at all. On both machine translators, there is no data that gets one point from more than ten raters. This shows that both Google Translate and Instagram Machine Translation do not produce completely unreadable translations.

# Similarities and Differences between Google Translate and Instagram Machine Translation

### **Original Caption**

Alaina wearing the first outfit I ever bought her when I found out I was having a girl!!! Swipe to see when I bought the outfit and see last photo for reality of this photoshoot □

Google Translate	Instagram Machine Translation
Alaina mengenakan pakaian pertama yang saya beli ketika saya mengetahui bahwa saya memiliki seorang gadis!!! Geser untuk melihat saat saya membeli pakaian tersebut dan lihat foto terakhir untuk realita	Alaina mengenakan pakaian pertama yang pernah saya beli ketika saya tahu saya punya anak perempuan!!! Swipe untuk melihat pakaian dan melihat foto terakhir untuk realita pemotretan ini
pemotretan ini �	

#### **Similarities and Differences**

In the translation results, there is a difference in the word "pernah", where in the translation produced by Instagram Machine Translation the word "ever" is translated into "pernah" while in Google Translate the word is omitted. Another difference is in the word "swipe" which translated to "geser" in Google Translate while on Instagram Machine Translation the word is still written "swipe". In addition,

the sentence "Swipe to see when I bought the outfit" translated properly by Google Translate into "Geser untuk melihat saat saya membeli pakaian tersebut," while on Instagram Machine Translation, the word "bought" is omitted and only translated as "Swipe untuk melihat pakaian"

# **Original Caption**

Feeling so so grateful  $\square \square \square$  I cannot believe we only have a few more weeks until we are a little family! God willing  $\square$ 

Google Translate	Instagram Machine Translation	
Merasa sangat	Merasa sangat	
bersyukur $\Box \Box \Box$	bersyukur □□□ Aku	
Saya tidak percaya	tidak percaya kita	
kita hanya memiliki	hanya memiliki	
beberapa minggu	beberapa minggu lagi	
lagi sampai kita	sampai kita menjadi	
menjadi keluarga	keluarga	
kecil! Insya	kecil! InsyaAllah	
Allah �		

#### **Similarities and Differences**

In this translation, almost both machine translations produce the same translation. The only difference is that "I" translated to "Saya" in Google Translate, while on Instagram Machine Translation, the word "I" translated to "Aku."

#### **Original Caption**

Happy Friday and happy March Lovelies!! Let's have a coffee date to celebrate □�□ My sisters arecoming to town this weekend and I'm so excited! They haven't even met Leo yet! �

Google Translate	Instagram Machine Translation
Selamat hari	Mari kita
Jumat dan selamat	minum kopi untuk
Maret Lovelies!!	merayakanya 🗆 🚱 🗆
Mari kita kencan	Saudariku akan
minum kopi untuk	datang ke kota akhir
merayakannya □�□	pekan ini dan aku
Kakak-kakakku akan	sangat bersemangat!
datang ke kota akhir	Mereka bahkan
pekan ini dan aku	belum bertemu Leo!
sangat bersemangat!	

Mereka bahkan belum bertemu Leo!

## **Similarities and Differences**

In the translation, the word "coffee date" translated to "kencan minum kopi" in Google Translate, while in Instagram Machine Translation, the word "date" is omitted and only translated to "minum kopi". Furthermore, the word "My sister" translated to "kakak-kakaku" on Google Translate while on Instagram Machine Translation, the word translated to "saudariku"

#### CONCLUSION

The results of this study indicate that the two machine translators, namely Google Translate Instagram Machine and Translation, both produced less accurate, acceptable, and less readable translations. Google but Translate considered better because it has a higher percentage of translations that get 3 points in all aspects. In the aspect of accuracy, the data that is considered accurate or gets 3 points on google translate is 32.5% while the Instagram machine translation is only 15%. Then for data that is considered less accurate or gets 2 points, google translate has a percentage of 58.33% while Instagram machine translation has a higher percentage of 61.67% and for data that is considered inaccurate or gets 1 point, Google translate has a small percentage, namely only 9.17% and Instagram Machine translation has a percentage of 23.33%.

For the acceptability aspect, Google Translate has a percentage of data that gets 3 points as much as 48% while Instagram Machine Translation, only has a percentage of 22.62%. Furthermore, for data that is considered less acceptable or gets 2 points, google translate has a percentage of 44.5% while Instagram Machine Translation has a higher percentage of 51.5%. Then, for data that is considered unacceptable or gets 1 point, google translate has a small percentage of only 7.5% while Instagram Machine Translation has a much higher

JELLT (Journal of English Language and Literature Teaching)

Vol. 7, No. 2 November 2022

percentage of 25.88%.

For the readability aspect, the data that is considered to have a high readability level or get 3 points on google translate is 46.25% while on Instagram Machine Translation there is only 29.5%. Furthermore, for data that is considered to have a medium level of readability, google translate has a percentage of 45.75% while Instagram machine translation has a percentage of 54.5%. Then, for data that is considered to have a low readability level or gets one point, Google Translate has a percentage of 8% and Instagram machine translation has a percentage of 16%.

It is recommended that the use of machine translators is accompanied by human intervention to produce translations that are accurate, acceptable, and have a high level of readability. For future researchers, it is hoped that they will be able to conduct more in-depth research by conducting interviews with assessors to find out the reasons why they give points one, two, or three to a translation result. Apart from that, they can also research machine translations such other Microsoft SYSTRAN. Translation. Translate iTranslate, Dict, Yandex Translate, and Microsoft Bing.

#### **REFERENCES**

Ahrenberg, L. (2017). Comparing machine translation and human translation: A case study. In RANLP 2017: The First Workshop Human-Informed on **Translation** *Interpreting* and *Technology* (HiT-IT) (pp. 21-28). Association Computational for Linguistics.

Halimah. (2018). Comparison Of Human Translation With Google . *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra*, 11-29.

(https://www.ef.com/assetscdn/WIBIwq6R dJvcD9bc8RMd/cefcom-epi-site/reports/2021/ef-epi-2021-english.pdf, 2021)

Nababan, M., Nuraeni, A., & Sumardiono. (2012). Pengembangan Model Penilaian

Kualitas Terjemahan. *Kajian Linguistik dan Sastra*, Vol. 24, 39-57.

Peng, H. (2018, March). The impact of machine translation and computer-aided translation on translators. In IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering (Vol. 322, No. 5, p. 052024). IOP Publishing.

Macken, L., Prou, D., & Tezcan, A. (2020, June). Quantifying the effect of machine translation in a high-quality human translation production process. In *Informatics* (Vol. 7, No. 2, p. 12). Multidisciplinary Digital Publishing Institute.

Meilasari, P. (2019). Instagram Translation Machine: *Widya Warta*, 124-133.

Ninggolan, W., Sinurat, B., & Hutauruk, B. S. (2020). Accuracy of the Translations of English Noun Phrases into Indonesian Using Google Translate. *Journal of English Teaching as a Foreign Language*, 66-87.

Thriveni, C. (2002). Cultural elements in translation: The Indian perspective. *Translation Journal*. 6/1

Tripathi, S., & Sarkhel, J. K. (2010). Approaches to machine translation. *Annals of Library and Information Studies*, 388-393.